) (EBNI BRIN BIBLI BON BUNG 1616 (BRIN 1616) 1 (BBNR) (N BNIBBLI NB) BUNG 1861 (N 166)

04-CV-00983-M1SC

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

LODGED MAIL

APR 3 0 2004

CUSKA U.S. EMILIFER COURS

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT SEATTLE

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, THE STATE OF WASHINGTON, and THE TULALIP TRIBES OF WASHINGTON,

Plaintiffs,

V.

WASTE MANAGEMENT OF WASHINGTON, INC. f/k/a WASHINGTON WASTE HAULING AND RECYCLING, INC.,

Defendant.

CIVIL ACTION NO.

C04-983Z

RELATED CASES:

C97-152D

C97-1648WD

C98-300R

C99-665R

C02-1126R

CONSENT DECREE FOR NATURAL RESOURCE DAMAGES
BETWEEN THE UNITED STATES, WASTE
MANAGEMENT OF WASHINGTON, INC., THE TULALIP SECTION
17 CORPORATION, AND THE TULALIP TRIBES OF WASHINGTON

This Consent Decree is made and entered into by the United States of America, on behalf

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

of the Fish and Wildlife Service of the United States Department of the Interior ("FWS") and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration of the United States Department of Commerce ("NOAA"), the Washington Department of Ecology on behalf of the State of Washington, and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington, as their respective interests appear in the complaint, including as trustees for natural resources (collectively referred to as "Plaintiffs") and descendant Waste Management of Washington, Inc., f/k/a Washington Waste Hauling and Recycling, Inc. (hereinafter "Settling Defendant").

I. INTRODUCTION

- The Plaintiffs allege that the Tulalip Landfill is located on Ebey Island between 1. Steamboat Slough and Ebey Slough in the Snohomish River delta system between Everett and 11 Marysville, Washington. Ebcy Island is located in Snohomish County, Township 30N, Range 12 SE, Section 32. The Tulalip Landfill Superfund Site ("the Site"), located within the Tulalip 13 Indian Reservation, occupies approximately 147 acres of the western portion of Ebey Island, just to the west of Interstate 5 and the Burlington Northern Railroad. The landfill area ("the Tulalip Landfill") is bordered by a berm and is surrounded primarily by wetlands in the form of freshwater and brackish water marshes. To the west of the landfill area are approximately 160 lacres of salt marsh.
- The Plaintiffs allege that in 1964, The Tulalip Tribes, a Section 17 Corporation federal corporation chartered pursuant to Section 17 of the Indian Reorganization Act, as amended, 25 U.S.C. § 477, leased the Site to Seattle Disposal Company for a period of 10 years. 21 The lease was renewed in 1972. From 1964 to 1979, Seattle Disposal Company, its general partners J. Razore, J. Banchero, and other partners, and Marine Disposal Company, operated the Site, then known as the "Big Flats Landfill," as a disposal site for commercial and industrial waste. The Plaintiffs allege that waste material collected in King County, Snohomish County, and communities in and around the Puget Sound region, including waste materials containing

26

3

4

5

7

8

9

15

17

18

27

28

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

l	hazardous substances generated or transported by the Settling Defendant, was delivered to the
2	Site by a variety of methods. In 1979, the landfill was closed and capped pursuant to the Rivers
3	and Harbors Act of 1899, 33 U.S.C. §§ 403 and 407, and the Federal Water Pollution Control
4	Act, 33 U.S.C. §§ 1311, 1319, 1342, and 1344, pursuant to a consent decree entered in the
5	United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on October 19, 1977, No.
6	C77-721M. Additional capping materials, including construction debris and earthen materials,
7	were placed on the source area by other parties after the 1979 consent decree closure, pursuant to
8	the NPDES permit.

- The Plaintiffs allege that hazardous substances within the definition of Section 3. 101(14) of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act "CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14), MTCA, RCW 70.105D.020(7), have been released into the 12 lenvironment from the Site. Hazardous substances have been found in soils in and around the 13 Site, in sediments around the Site, in leachate emanating from the Site, and in ground water at the Site. Hazardous substances of concern found in soils and sediments include benzo(a)anthracene, 15 benzo(a)pyrene, benzo(b)flouranthene, benzo(k)flouranthene, bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate, chrysene, 1,4-dichlorobenzene, flouranthene, fluorine, naphthalene, N-nitroso-di-n-propylamine, polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), and pyrene. Metals were also found at the Site, including arsenic, lead, and chromium. Samples of leachate flowing from the Site have shown levels of arsenic, barium, cadmium, iron, zinc, manganese, toluene, ethylbenzene, PCBs, and acenaphthene.
 - 4. The Plaintiffs allege that, as a result of these alleged releases of hazardous substances, injuries to, destruction or losses of natural resources have occurred at the Site, and that such injuries, destruction or losses are compensable under Section 107(a)(4)(C) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a)(4)(C), and the Model Toxics Control Act ("MTCA"), Ch. 70.105D RCW.

26

25

20.

21

9

27

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

-3-

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

26

27

28

1	NOW, THEREFORE, the parties agree, and it is hereby ORDERED ADJUDGED, AND	į			
2	DECREED as follows:				
3	II. <u>PARTIES</u>				
4	10. "United States" means the United States of America, in all its capacities, including	ıg			
5	inter alia all departments, instrumentalities, administrations, natural resource trustees, and				
6	agencies of the Federal Government.				
7	11. The "Tulalip Tribes of Washington" is a federally recognized Indian tribe				
8	organized under Section 16 of the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934, as amended, 25 U.S.C. §				
9	476, and is the successor in interest to the Snohomish, Snoqualmie, Skykomish and other tribes				
10	and bands party to the Treaty of Point Elliot.				
11	12. The "Department of Ecology" means the Washington Department of Ecology as				
12	designated state trustee pursuant to Section 107(f) of CERCLA, and 40 C.F.R. Part 300, Subpart				
13	G, and in its statutory role under MTCA, Ch. 70.105D, RCW.				
14	13. "The State of Washington" or "the State" means the State of Washington,				
15	including inter alia all departments, administrations, natural resource trustees and agencies				
16	thereof.				
17	14. "Settling Defendant" means defendant and signatory to this Consent Decree Was	te			
18	Management of Washington, Inc., f/k/a Washington Waste Hauling and Recycling, Inc.				
19	III. <u>JURISDICTION</u>				
20	15. This Court has jurisdiction over this Consent Decree under Sections 107(a) and				
21	113(b) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607(a) & 9613(b), 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 & 1345, and				
22	supplemental jurisdiction over state law claims as set forth in 28 U.S.C. Sec. 1367.				
23	IV. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>				
24	16. Whenever the following capitalized terms are used in this Consent Decree, they				
25	shall have the following meaning:				
26	U.S. Dept. of Justice				
27	c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, N	ΙĖ			
28	Consent Decree for Seattle, WA 98115 Natural Resource Damages -5- (206) 526-6617				

1	a. "Natural Resources" include land, fish, wildlife, biota, air, water,				
2	groundwater, drinking water supplies, and other such resources belonging to, managed by, held				
3	in trust by, appertaining to, or otherwise controlled by the United States (including the resources				
4	of the exclusive economic zone), the State of Washington or the Tulalip Tribes of Washington.				
5	b. "Natural Resource Damages" means compensatory and remedial relief				
6	recoverable by the Federal, State and Tribal Trustees of Natural Resources on behalf of the				
7	public or tribal members for injury to, destruction of, or loss of use of any and all Natural				
8	Resources resulting from the release of hazardous substances, including (1) costs of damage				
9	assessment; (2) compensation for loss, injury, impairment, damage or destruction of Natural				
10	Resources, whether temporary or permanent, or for loss of use value, non-use value, passive				
11	value, option value, amenity value, bequest value, existence value, consumer surplus, economic				
12	rent, or any similar value of Natural Resources; (3) any diminution in value of Natural Resources				
13	pending restoration; and (4) costs of restoring, rehabilitating, replacing, or acquiring the				
14	equivalent of the Natural Resources.				
15	c. "Covered Matters" means any civil or administrative liability Settling				
16	Defendant may have to the United States, the State of Washington (including the Washington				
17	Department of Ecology), the Tulalip Tribes of Washington, or any other individual or entity for				
18	any claim under 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607(a)(4)(c) & 9607(f), 33 U.S.C. § 1321, 33 U.S.C. §§ 2702,				
19	2706, chapter 70.105D RCW, chapter 90.48 RCW, or any other federal, state, tribal or common				
20	law, for Natural Resource Damages resulting from releases of hazardous substances at or from				
21	the Tulalip Landfill.				
22					
23					
24					
25					
26	U.S. Dept. of Justice				
27	c/o NOAA DARĆ 7600 Sand Point Way, NI				

28 Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

V. PAYMENT AND OTHER PROVISIONS

17. Within 30 days of receiving notice of the entry of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant shall deliver to:

Registry of the U.S. District Court c/o Clerk, United States District Court Western District of Washington 1010 Fifth Avenue, Room 215 Seattle, WA 98104

a certified check payable to the Clerk of the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington in the amount of ONE HUNDRED NINETY-THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$190,000.00). The certified check submitted by Settling Defendant shall reference the "Tulalip Landfill NRD Settlement."

- 18. Within 5 business days of making the payment specified in Paragraph 17, Settling Defendant shall provide written notification of the aforesaid delivery to the persons designated in Paragraph 28.
- 19. The amount deposited into the Registry of the Court shall be managed pursuant to the Order Directing the Deposit of Funds into the Registry of the Court issued by Judge Dimmick in <u>United States v. Ace Galvanizing, Inc.</u>, No. C97-152D (Attachment A hereto), which is hereby incorporated into this Decree. These funds shall be used by Plaintiffs only for assessing, restoring, rehabilitating, replacing or acquiring the equivalent of the natural resources injured, destroyed, or lost as a reult of releases at or from the Site, as provided in 42 U.S.C. § 9607(f)(1).
- 20. If Settling Defendant fails to timely make any payment required under this Consent Decree, it shall be liable, commencing the day after payment is due, for interest on the unpaid balance at the federal judgment interest rate computed in accordance with 28 U.S.C. § 1961 as of the date payment is due, and, if incurred, the costs of enforcement and collection pursuant to the Federal Debt Collection Procedure Act, 28 U.S.C. § 3001 et seq.

25

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

14

19

20

26

27

28

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

VI. COVENANTS NOT TO SUE

- 21. In consideration of the Settling Defendant's timely compliance with the terms of this Consent Decree, the United States, the State of Washington (including the Washington Department of Ecology) and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington covenant not to sue or take any other civil or administrative action, after entry of this Consent Decree, against Settling Defendant for Covered Matters. This covenant not to sue shall extend to, and inure to the benefit of, the Settling Defendant and its past, present and future directors, officers, employees, acting in those capacities, and its successors and assigns. This covenant not to sue is subject to the reservations in Section VIII of this Decree.
- 22. In consideration of the Plaintiffs' covenants not to sue in this Section VI of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant agrees not to assert any claim or cause of action against any of the Plaintiffs arising out of injuries to Natural Resources resulting from releases of hazardous substances at or from the Site, or to seek any costs, damages or attorneys' fees from any Plaintiff in connection with injuries to natural resources resulting from releases of hazardous substances at or from the Site.

VII. CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

23. Subject to the Reservation of Rights in Section VIII of this Consent Decree, Plaintiffs agree that by entering into this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant will have resolved its liability for Covered Matters, as described in Paragraphs 15(c) and 20 of this Consent Decree, pursuant to Sections 122(g)(5) and 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(g)(5) and 9613(f)(2), MTCA, RCW Chapter 70.105D.040(1),(2) and RCW 90.48.142, and shall be protected against claims for contribution regarding Covered Matters as provided in Sections 122(g)(5) and 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9622(g)(5) and 9613(f)(2), RCW 70.105D.040(d). Contribution protection shall extend to, and inure to the benefit of, the Settling Defendant and its past, present and future directors, officers, employees, to the extent they were

26

25

l

2

3

7

8

9

10

11

15

16

17

19

20

21

23

27

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

	41	1111	4			
acung i	n those	capacities,	and	successors	and	assigns.

VIII. RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

- 24. Nothing in this Consent Decree is intended to be nor shall it be construed as a release or covenant not to sue for any claim or cause of action, administrative or judicial, civil or criminal, past or future, at law or in equity, which the Plaintiffs may have against Settling Defendant for:
- Any claims and liability as a result of failure to make the payments a. required by this Consent Decree;
- b. Any liability arising from the past, present, or future disposal, release, or threat of release of any hazardous substance, hazardous waste, or solid waste other than releases or threats of releases at or from the Site; or
 - Any criminal liability.
- 25. As required by MTCA, RCW 70.105D.040(4)(c), nothing in this Consent Decree is intended to be not shall it be construed as a release or covenant not to sue by the State of Washington for any claim or cause of action, administrative or judicial, civil or criminal, past or future, at law or in equity, which the State of Washington may have against Settling Defendant for factors not known to plaintiffs at the time of entry of the decree that are discovered and present a previously unknown threat to human health or the environment. Factors known and threats known at the time of the entry of the Consent Decree include all facts, documents, evidence and data in the possession of plaintiffs at the time of entry of the Consent Decree, including but not limited to all of the facts set forth in documents in plaintiffs' administrative records for the Site.

IX. DISCLAIMER OF LIABILITY

26. Neither entry of this Consent Decree nor any action in accordance with this Consent Decree shall constitute an admission of liability under any federal, state, tribal or local

26

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

7

8

9

11

12

13

27

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

1	statute, regulation, ordinance, general maritime law or common law by Settling Defendant, its			
2	present or former officers, members, directors, trustees, shareholders, insurers, agents,			
3	representatives, employees, subsidiaries, successors, assigns or affiliates, for any fine, penalty,			
4	response costs, damages, or claims or any issues of fact or law for releases of hazardous			
5	substances at the Site.			
6	27. The parties further agree that none of the provisions of this Consent Decree or			
7	evidence of negotiations shall be offered or received in evidence in this action or any other action			
8	or proceedings by any other party for any purpose, except for enforcement of this Consent Decree			
9	or except as specifically provided herein.			
10	X. <u>NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS</u>			
11	28. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree, written notice is required to be			
12	given or a report or other document is required to be sent by one party to the other, it shall be			
13	directed to individuals at the addresses specified below, unless those individuals or their			
14	successors give written notice of a change. All notices and submissions shall be considered			
15	effective upon receipt, unless otherwise provided.			
16	As to the United States:			
17	Chief Environmental Enforcement Section			
18	Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice			
19	P.O. Box 7611 Ben Franklin Station			
20	Washington, D.C. 20044			
21	As to the State of Washington:			
22	Craig Thompson Toxics Cleanup Program			
23	State of Washington P.O. Box 47600			
24	Olympia, Washington 98504-7600			
25				
26	U.S. Dept. of Justice c/o NOAA DARC			
27	7600 Sand Point Way, NE			
28	Consent Decree for Seattle, WA 98115 Natural Resource Damages -10- (206) 526-6617			

As to the <u>Tulalip</u> Tribes of Washington:

Tom McKinsey
Tulalip Tribes of Washington
6326 33rd Ave., N.E.
Marysville, Washington 98271

As to Waste Management of Washington, Inc:

Mr. Steven T. Joycc Director Closed Site Management Group Waste Management, Inc. 4 Liberty Lane Hampton, MA 04862

XI. ENTRY OR DISAPPROVAL OF DECREE

- 29. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a period of not less than thirty (30) days and shall be made available for public notice and comment in accordance with Section 122(d)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(d)(2), 28 C.F.R. § 50.7, and RCW 70.105D.040(4)(a). The United States, the State of Washington and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington intend to defend the settlement embodied in this Consent Decree, unless comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations that indicate that the Consent Decree is not fair, reasonable or in the public interest, in which case the United States and the Tulalip Tribes of Washington reserve the right to withdraw or withhold their consent to the Consent Decree. The State of Washington reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations that demonstrate that the proposed settlement would not lead to a more expeditious restoration of natural resources. Settling Defendant consents to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice.
- 30. After its entry by the Court, this Consent Decree shall be considered an enforceable judgment for purposes of post-judgment collection in accordance with Rule 69 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and other applicable federal statutory authority.

26

25

22

23

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

27

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

- 31. Settling Defendant hereby waives the 60-day notice requirement applicable to the trustees by virtue of Section 113(g)(1) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(g)(1), and agrees that any failure by Plaintiffs to give the notice required by that section shall not constitute a deficiency in the Complaint or in this Consent Decree.
- 32. This Court retains jurisdiction over both the subject matter of this Consent Decree and the Parties hereto for the duration of the performance of the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree solely for the purpose of enforcing those terms and conditions.

XII. MISCELLANEOUS

- 33. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other appropriate relief relating to the Site, Settling Defendant shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or claim based upon 12 the principles of waiver, res judicata, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting, or 13 other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by the United State in the 14 subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case; provided, however, 15 that nothing in this paragraph affects the enforceability of the covenants not to sue set forth in Section VI.
 - 34. Settling Defendant shall not reference or rely upon its payment under this Consent Decree in any application for dredged or fill material under Section 404 of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act, or in any proceeding arising out of the Settling Defendant's application, or failure to apply, for such a permit.
 - 35. This Consent Decree shall not affect any party's rights against any person or entity not a party to this Consent Decree, except for the contribution protection provisions of Section VII. No person or entity other than the parties hereto shall have the authority to seek to enforce the terms of this Consent Decree.
 - 36. This Consent Decree constitutes the entire agreement among the parties with

26

25

1

2

5

8

9

16

17

20

21

27

28

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

U.S. Dept. of Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

27

1	requirements set forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any applicable local		
2	rules of this Court, including, but i	not limited to, service of a summons.	
3			
4	SO ORDERED THIS	DAY OF,,	
5			
6			==-
7		UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDG	JE -
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			U.S. Dept. of Justice c/o NOAA DARC
27	Consent Decree for		7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115
	Natural Resource Damages	-14-	(206) 526-6617

	We have because to the outer of the forces in Consent Doorse.				
1	We hereby consent to the entry of the foregoing Consent Decree:				
2	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:				
3					
4					
5	9/26/04	Acting	THOMAS L. SANSONETTI Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources		
6 7	Date				
8		•	Division United States Department of Justice		
9			Washington, D.C.		
10			t		
11			SEAN CARMAN		
12	14/28/04 Date	\			
13	,		Trial Attorney Environmental Enforcement Section		
14			United States Department of Justice NOAA DARC - DOJ 7600 Sand Point Way, N.E. Scattle, Washington 98115-0070 (206) 526-6617		
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
	I				

Consent Decree for Natural Resource Damages

24

25

26

27

28

1 FOR THE STATE OF WASHINGTON: 2 3 4 5 Date James Pendowski Program Director 6 Toxics Cleanup Program Washington Department of Ecology P.O. Box 47600 7 Olympia, Washington 98504-7600 8 9 10 11 Date #12/1 12 Steven Thiele Assistant Attorney General 13 Ecology Division P.O. Box 40117 14 Olympia, Washington 98504-0117 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

U.S. Dept. of Justice c/o NOAA DARC 7600 Sand Point Way, NE Seattle, WA 98115 (206) 526-6617

26

27

28

THE TULALIP TRIBES OF WASHINGTON

Oct 9,03

Date:

Blanday & Glance &

Vice Chairman

Board of Directors

By the signature on this page, Waste Management of Washington, Inc., f/k/a Washington Waste Hauling and Recycling, Inc. hereby agrees to be bound by the terms of this Consent Decree

 $\frac{10/10/03}{\text{Date}}$

Stephen T. Joyce, Director-CSMG

Agent for Service of Process:

General Counsel Waste Management, Inc. 1001 Fannin, Suite 4000 Houston, Texas 77002