

1 SAM HIRSCH
 2 Acting Assistant Attorney General
 3 Environment & Natural Resources Division
 4 United States Department of Justice
 5 BRADLEY R. O'BRIEN
 6 Senior Attorney
 7 Environmental Enforcement Section
 8 301 Howard Street, Suite 1050
 9 San Francisco, California 94105
 10 Telephone: (415) 744-6484
 11 Facsimile: (415) 744-6476
 12 E-mail: Brad.obrien@usdoj.gov

13 FLORENCE T. NAKAKUNI
 14 United States Attorney
 15 TOM HELPER
 16 Assistant United States Attorney
 17 Room 6-100, PJKK Federal Building
 18 300 Ala Moana Boulevard
 19 Honolulu, Hawaii 96850
 20 Email: Tom.helper@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America

21 DAVID M. LOUIE
 22 Attorney General
 23 State Of Hawaii
 24 AMANDA J. WESTON
 25 Deputy Attorney General
 26 Land Transportation Division
 27 465 S. King Street, 3rd Floor
 28 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813
 Email: Amanda.J.Weston@hawaii.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Hawaii

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF HAWAII

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and the
the STATE OF HAWAII,

Plaintiffs,

v.

DENAK SHIP MANAGEMENT and
VOGETRADER SHIPPING INC.,

Defendants.

CASE NO.

CONSENT DECREE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

I. PARTIES1

II. INTRODUCTION1

III. JURISDICTION AND VENUE3

IV. APPLICABILITY4

V. DEFINITIONS.....4

VI. SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS6

VII. STIPULATED PENALTIES9

VIII. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT10

IX. COSTS11

X. NOTICES.....12

XI. EFFECTIVE DATE.....13

XII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION13

XIII. MODIFICATION13

XIV. TERMINATION.....14

XV. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION14

XVI. SIGNATORIES/SERVICE.....14

XVII. INTEGRATION15

XVIII. FINAL JUDGMENT16

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

I. PARTIES

This Consent Decree (“Consent Decree”) is made and entered into by and among the following parties (hereinafter referred to collectively as “the Parties” and individually as “Party”):

A. United States of America (“United States”), on behalf of the United States Department of Commerce, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (“NOAA”);

B. State of Hawaii (“State”); and

C. Denak Ship Management and Vogetrader Shipping, Inc. (“Settling Defendants”).

II. INTRODUCTION

A. On February 5, 2010, the 733 foot cargo carrier M/V Vogetrader (“Vogetrader”) grounded on coral reef habitat near the entrance channel to Barbers Point Harbor, Oahu, Hawaii. The vessel was owned and/or operated at that time by Settling Defendants. The United States Coast Guard, the State and Settling Defendants developed a Salvage Plan and coordinated with oil spill response personnel due to a substantial threat of a discharge of oil as the result of the grounding. The Vogetrader was ultimately removed from the reef on the day of the grounding; however, physical injuries to coral reef habitats and associated resources resulting from response activities occurred. All of the foregoing events

1 are referred to as the “Incident.”

2 B. The participating Trustees for the Natural Resources injured by the
3 Incident include NOAA and the State. NOAA is designated as a Trustee pursuant
4 to subpart G of the National Oil and Hazardous Substances Pollution Contingency
5 Plan (“NCP”) (40 C.F.R. §§ 300.600 *et seq.*) and Executive Order 12580 (3 C.F.R.,
6 1987 Comp. 193, 52 Fed. Reg. 2923 (Jan. 23, 1987)) as amended by Executive
7 Order 12777 (56 Fed. Reg. 54757 (Oct. 18, 1991)). The State is a designated
8 Trustee pursuant to Section 1006 (b)(3) of the Oil Pollution Act of 1990 (“OPA”),
9 33 U.S.C. § 2706 and subpart G of the NCP. Additionally, the State has natural
10 resource trustee authority pursuant to Chapter 128D HRS and 11-451 Hawaii
11 Administrative Rules.
12
13
14
15

16 C. After the Incident, NOAA, in coordination with the State, as Trustees
17 for Natural Resources, (hereinafter, the “Trustees”) and Settling Defendants
18 undertook a Cooperative Natural Resource Damage Assessment, pursuant to which
19 NOAA and Settling Defendants gathered and analyzed data and other information
20 that was used to determine and quantify the resource injuries. NOAA determined
21 that the Incident had caused injury to approximately 103,027 coral colonies,
22 although Settling Defendants dispute this amount. In November 2013, under
23 NOAA oversight, Settling Defendants undertook Emergency Restoration, as
24 defined in the OPA regulations at 15 C.F.R. 990.26, in the form of rubble removal
25
26
27
28

1 and coral reattachment at the Incident site. The Trustees also intend to publish and
2 invite comment from the public concerning a draft Damage Assessment and
3 Restoration Plan (“draft Plan”). The draft Plan will describe alternative restoration
4 projects, in addition to the completed Emergency Restoration, to restore, replace,
5 or acquire the equivalent of the resources and their services injured by the Incident.
6
7

8 D. The United States and the State have filed this action to recover
9 claims for natural resource damages.
10

11 E. The Parties agree, and the Court, by entering this Consent Decree,
12 finds, that this Consent Decree has been negotiated by the Parties in good faith,
13 that it is intended to avoid certain litigation among the Parties and that it is fair,
14 reasonable, and in the public interest.
15

16 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ADJUDGED, ORDERED AND
17 DECREED as follows:
18

19 **III. JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

20 1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action
21 pursuant to, *inter alia*, 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1345, 1355 & 1367, Sections 1002(a),
22 (b)(1)(A) & (b)(2)(A), 1006, & 1017(b) of OPA, 33 U.S.C. §§ 2702(a), (b)(1)(A)
23 & (b)(2)(A), 2706, 2717(b). Venue is proper in this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C.
24 §§ 1391 & 1395, 33 U.S.C. § 2717, because Settling Defendants do business in,
25 and the Incident occurred in, this judicial district. The Court has personal
26
27
28

1 jurisdiction over Settling Defendants for this particular action, and each Party does
2 not contest the Court’s jurisdiction and does not contest the propriety of venue in
3 this judicial district for the purposes of this Consent Decree.
4

5 **IV. APPLICABILITY**

6 2. The obligations of this Consent Decree apply to and are binding upon
7 the United States, the State, and upon Settling Defendants and/or Settling
8 Defendants’ successors, assigns, or other entities or persons otherwise bound by
9 law.
10

11 **V. DEFINITIONS**

12 3. Terms used in this Consent Decree that are defined in OPA or in the
13 natural resource damage assessment regulations promulgated pursuant to OPA, 15
14 C.F.R. Part 990, shall have the meanings assigned to them in OPA or in such
15 regulations, unless otherwise provided in this Consent Decree. Whenever the
16 terms set forth below are used in this Consent Decree, the following definitions
17 shall apply:
18

19 (a) “Complaint” shall mean the civil complaint filed in this action
20 concurrently with the lodging of this Consent Decree.
21

22 (b) “Entry of this Consent Decree” or “Entry” shall occur on the
23 date when this Consent Decree, after signing by the Judge, is entered in the civil
24 docket under Rule 79(a) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
25
26
27
28

1 (c) "Natural Resource" and "Natural Resources" shall mean land,
2 fish, wildlife, biota, air, water, ground water, drinking water supplies, and other
3 such resources belonging to, managed by, held in trust by, appertaining to, or
4 otherwise controlled by the United States and/or the State, and shall also mean the
5 services provided by such resources to other resources or to humans.
6

7
8 (d) "Natural Resource Trustees" or "Trustees" shall mean those
9 federal and state agencies or officials designated or authorized pursuant to the
10 Clean Water Act (Federal Water Pollution Control Act), 33 U.S.C. §§ 1251, *et*
11 *seq.*, OPA, and/or applicable state law to act as Trustees for the Natural Resources
12 belonging to, managed by, controlled by, or appertaining to the United States or
13 the State. Specifically, as used in this Consent Decree, the participating Trustees
14 are NOAA and the State.
15
16

17
18 (e) "Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree
19 identified by an arabic numeral.
20

21 (f) "Plaintiffs" shall mean the United States on behalf of NOAA,
22 and the State.
23

24 (g) "Restore" or "Restoration" shall mean any action or
25 combination of actions to restore, rehabilitate, replace, or acquire the equivalent of
26 any Natural Resource or its services injured, lost, or destroyed as a result of the
27 Incident.
28

1 (h) "Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree
2 identified by a roman numeral.

3 (i) "Settling Defendants" shall mean Denak Ship Management and
4 Voetrader Shipping Inc.
5

6 **VI. SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS**

7
8 4. Within sixty (60) days after Entry of this Consent Decree, Settling
9 Defendants shall pay the total amount of eight hundred forty thousand dollars
10 (\$840,000) to be disbursed as follows:

11 (a) The sum of six hundred ninety five thousand six hundred fifty
12 seven dollars (\$695,657) shall be paid to NOAA, on behalf of the Natural
13 Resource Trustees, for the purposes set forth in Subparagraphs (iii) and (iv) below.
14 Such payment shall be made by Electronic Funds Transfer ("EFT") to the United
15 States Department of Justice in accordance with instructions that the Financial
16 Litigation Unit of the United States Attorney's Office for the District of Hawaii
17 shall provide Settling Defendants following Entry of this Consent Decree by this
18 Court. At the time of payment, Settling Defendants shall simultaneously send
19 written notice of payment and a copy of any transmittal documentation (which
20 shall reference DOJ case number 90-5-1-1-11013/1, case name, and civil action
21 number) to the Parties in accordance with Section X (Notices) of this Consent
22 Decree and to:
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 NOAA/NOS/OR&R
2 Damage Assessment and Restoration Revolving Fund
3 Attention: Kathy Salter
4 1305 East West Highway
5 SSMC4, Room 9331
6 Silver Spring, MD 20910-3281

7 The EFT and transmittal letter shall reflect that the payment is being made to the
8 NOAA DARRF Voetrader Grounding NRD Account (“Voetrader Grounding
9 NRD Account”). NOAA will assign these funds a special project number to allow
10 the funds to be maintained as a segregated account within the NOAA Damage
11 Assessment and Restoration Revolving Fund.

12 (i) NOAA shall, in accordance with law, manage funds in
13 the Voetrader Grounding NRD Account for use by the Natural Resource Trustees
14 in connection with Restoration of Natural Resources affected by the Incident.

15 NOAA shall not make any charge against the Voetrader Grounding NRD
16 Account for any management services provided.

17 (ii) NOAA shall hold all funds in the Voetrader Grounding
18 NRD Account subject to the provisions of this Consent Decree.

19 (iii) NOAA, in consultation with the State, commits to the
20 expenditure of the funds set forth in this Subparagraph (a) for the design,
21 implementation, permitting (as necessary), monitoring, and oversight of
22 Restoration projects and for the costs of complying with the requirements of the
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 law to conduct the restoration planning and implementation process. NOAA, in
2 consultation with the State, plans to use the funds for restoration, enhancement,
3 and/or protection of coral reef habitat and associated resources and for oversight of
4 these Restoration projects.
5

6 (iv) The allocation of funds for specific projects will be
7 contained in the Damage Assessment and Restoration Plan prepared jointly by the
8 Trustees, for which public notice, opportunity for public input, and consideration
9 of public comment will be provided. NOAA, in consultation with the State, retains
10 the ultimate authority and responsibility to use the funds in the Vogetrader
11 Grounding NRD Account to Restore Natural Resources in accordance with
12 applicable law, this Consent Decree, and the Damage Assessment and Restoration
13 Plan to be prepared jointly by the Trustees.
14
15
16
17

18 (b) The sum of one hundred forty four thousand three hundred
19 forty three dollars (\$144,343) shall be paid to NOAA for reimbursement of its
20 Natural Resource Damage Assessment costs associated with the Incident through
21 May 31, 2014. Payment shall be made by EFT to the United States Department of
22 Justice in accordance with instructions that the Financial Litigation Unit of the
23 United States Attorney's Office for the District of Hawaii shall provide to Settling
24 Defendants following Entry of this Consent Decree by this Court. At the time of
25 payment, Settling Defendants shall simultaneously send written notice of payment
26
27
28

1 and a copy of any transmittal documentation (which shall reference DOJ case
2 number 90-5-1-1-11013/1, case name, and civil action number) to the Parties in
3 accordance with Section X (Notices) of this Consent Decree.
4

5 **VII. STIPULATED PENALTIES**

6 5. If Settling Defendants fail to cause any payment to be made when due
7 as required by Section VI (Settlement Payments), above, Settling Defendants shall
8 pay to the United States and to the State, respectively, a stipulated penalty of one
9 thousand dollars (\$1,000) per day each, for each day that any such payment is late.
10
11

12 6. Any stipulated penalties, as described above, owing to the United
13 States shall be paid by EFT in accordance with instructions to be provided by the
14 Financial Litigation Unit of the United States Attorney's Office for the District of
15 Hawaii, or by certified or cashier's check in the amount due, payable to the
16 "United States Department of Justice," referencing DOJ case number 90-5-1-1-
17 11013/1, and delivered to the office of the United States Attorney, Financial
18 Litigation Unit, District of Hawaii. At the time of payment of stipulated penalties,
19 Settling Defendants shall simultaneously send written notice of payment, stating
20 that such payment is for late payment of amount(s) due under this Consent Decree,
21 and a copy of any transmittal documentation (which shall reference DOJ case
22 number 90-5-1-1-11013/1, case name, and civil action number) to the Parties in
23 accordance with Section X (Notices) of this Consent Decree.
24
25
26
27
28

1 this Court; or (2) based on information received by the Trustees after the date when
2 this Consent Decree is lodged with this Court that indicates that there was injury
3 to, destruction of, or loss of natural resources as a result of the Incident which was
4 of a type or magnitude unknown to the Trustees as of the said date.
5

6 11. Settling Defendants hereby covenant not to sue and agree not to assert
7 any claims or causes of action of any nature against the United States or the State
8 under federal, state, or local law, arising out of or relating to this Consent Decree
9 or to the Incident.
10

11 12. This Consent Decree does not limit or affect the rights of Settling
12 Defendants or of the Plaintiffs against any third parties, not party to this Consent
13 Decree, nor does it limit the rights of third parties, not party to this Consent
14 Decree, against Settling Defendants, except as otherwise provided by law.
15
16

17 13. This Consent Decree shall not be construed to create rights in, or grant
18 any cause of action to, any third party not party to this Consent Decree.
19

20 **IX. COSTS**
21

22 14. Plaintiffs shall be entitled to collect the costs (including reasonable
23 attorneys' fees) incurred in any action necessary to collect any portion of the
24 amounts due under Section VI (Settlement Payments) or any stipulated penalties
25 due but not paid under Section VII (Stipulated Penalties), above.
26
27
28

X. NOTICES

1
2 15. Unless otherwise specified herein, whenever notifications,
3 submissions, or communications are required by this Consent Decree, they shall be
4 made in writing and addressed as follows:
5

6 To the United States:
7

8 Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section
9 Environment and Natural Resources Division
10 United States Department of Justice
11 P.O. Box 7611
12 Ben Franklin Station
13 Washington, DC 20044-7611
14 Re: DOJ No. 90-5-1-1-11013/1

15 To NOAA:
16

17 Christopher J. Plaisted
18 Attorney-Advisor
19 Natural Resources Section
20 Office of General Counsel
21 501 W. Ocean Boulevard, Suite 4470
22 Long Beach, California 90802-4213

23 To State:
24

25 Amanda J. Weston
26 Deputy Attorney General
27 Land Transportation Division
28 465 S. King Street, 3rd Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

1 To Settling Defendants:

2 Eugene J. O'Connor
3 Montgomery McCracken Walker & Rhoads LLP
4 437 Madison Avenue
5 29th Floor
6 New York, New York 10022

7 16. Any Party may, by written notice to the other Parties, change its
8 designated notice recipient or notice address provided above.

9 17. Notices submitted pursuant to this Section shall be deemed submitted
10 upon mailing, unless otherwise provided in this Consent Decree or by mutual
11 agreement of the Parties in writing.
12

13 **XI. EFFECTIVE DATE**

14
15 18. The Effective Date of this Consent Decree shall be the date of the
16 Entry of this Consent Decree by the Court.
17

18 **XII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

19 19. The Court shall retain jurisdiction over this case until termination of
20 this Consent Decree, for the purpose of effectuating or enforcing compliance with
21 the terms of this Consent Decree.
22

23 **XIII. MODIFICATION**

24
25 20. The terms of this Consent Decree may be modified only by a
26 subsequent written agreement signed by all Parties. Where the modification
27 constitutes a material change to any term of this Consent Decree, it shall be
28

1 effective only upon approval by the Court.

2 **XIV. TERMINATION**

3
4 21. This Consent Decree shall be terminated when the Plaintiffs
5 determine that Settling Defendants have satisfactorily completed performance of
6 its obligations required by this Consent Decree, including payment of the amounts
7 required under Section VI (Settlement Payments) and any outstanding stipulated
8 penalties due under Section VII (Stipulated Penalties). Upon such termination, the
9 Parties shall file with the Court an appropriate stipulation reciting that the
10
11 Parties shall file with the Court an appropriate stipulation reciting that the
12 requirements of this Consent Decree have been met.

13 **XV. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

14
15 22. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with this Court for a period of
16 not less than thirty (30) days to allow the opportunity for public notice and
17 comment. The Plaintiffs reserve the right to withdraw from or withhold their
18 consent to this Consent Decree if the comments from the public regarding this
19 Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations indicating that this Consent Decree
20 is inappropriate, improper, or inadequate. Settling Defendants consent to Entry of
21 this Consent Decree without further notice.
22
23

24 **XVI. SIGNATORIES/SERVICE**

25
26 23. Each undersigned representative of Settling Defendants, the State, and
27 the United States, certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms
28

XVIII. FINAL JUDGMENT

27. Upon approval and Entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, this Consent Decree shall constitute a final judgment of the Court, in accordance with Rules 54 and 58 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, as among the Parties.

SO ORDERED

Dated and entered this ____ day of _____, _____.

United States District Judge

1 We hereby consent to the Entry of the foregoing Consent Decree, subject to the
2 Notice and Comment provisions of Section XV (Public Participation) of this
3 Consent Decree.

4
5 FOR THE UNITED STATES:

6
7
8
9 DATED: 10/23/14



ELLEN M. MAHAN
Deputy Chief
Environmental Enforcement Section
Environment & Natural Resources
Division
United States Department of Justice

10
11
12
13
14 DATED: 11/14/14




BRADLEY R. O'BRIEN
Senior Attorney
Environment and Natural Resources
Division
Environmental Enforcement Section
United States Department of Justice

15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 We hereby consent to the Entry of the foregoing Consent Decree, subject to the
2 Notice and Comment provisions of Section XV (Public Participation) of this
3 Consent Decree.

4
5 FOR THE STATE OF HAWAII:

6
7
8 DATED: November 3, 2014



AMANDA J. WESTON
Deputy Attorney General
Department of the Attorney General

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 We hereby consent to the Entry of the foregoing Consent Decree, subject to the
2 Notice and Comment provisions of Section XV (Public Participation) of this
3 Consent Decree.

4
5 FOR SETTLING DEFENDANTS Denak Ship Management and Voetrader
6 Shipping Inc.:

7
8
9
10 DATED: _____



EUGENE J. O'CONNOR
Montgomery McCracken Walker
& Rhoads LLP
437 Madison Avenue
29th Floor
New York, New York 10022

11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28