

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
NATIONAL OCEANIC AND ATMOSPHERIC ADMINISTRATION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20230

In the Matter of: Anthony Black, American Triumph, LLC, Yen Ming Yuan, Respondents.	Docket Number: PI0904340
--	---------------------------------

ORDER DENYING RESPONDENTS' PETITION FOR ADMINISTRATOR REVIEW

This is a fisheries enforcement matter involving civil charges brought against Respondents -- the captain, fishing master, and corporate entity owner of a U.S. flagged purse seine vessel -- by the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA or Agency). The Agency charged Respondents with multiple violations of the Western and Central Pacific Fisheries Convention Implementation Act¹ and regulations promulgated by the Agency under the Act that implemented internationally agreed upon measures to limit the use of fish aggregating devices (FADs). Respondents denied the charges, and the matter went before an Administrative Law Judge (ALJ).

Early in the proceedings, Respondents challenged the process the Agency used in promulgating the final rule underlying the FAD-related regulations. Specifically, Respondents challenged the validity of the Agency's decision to waive of the 30-day delay between publication of the final rule in the Federal Register and its effective date. The ALJ, precluded by regulation from ruling on issues related to the validity of regulations promulgated by the Agency, certified the issue for interlocutory review by the NOAA Administrator. The Administrator accepted review of the issue and issued an order (the Interlocutory Order), dated November 15, 2012, upholding as valid the Agency's waiver of the 30-day delay.

After the issuance of the Interlocutory Order and following a series of administrative hearings in which the Agency and Respondents presented evidence and testimony with respect to the charges, the presiding ALJ issued an Initial Decision and Order (Initial Decision), finding seven of eight counts proven by the Agency and assessing monetary penalties against the Respondents in the amount of \$562,068.27. Separately, the ALJ also provided a "strong recommendation" to the NOAA Administrator to condition all permits held by the corporate entity vessel owner, Respondent American Triumph, LLC, to prohibit the hiring and/or retaining of the vessel's fishing master, Respondent Yen Min Yuan.

¹ 16 U.S.C. § 6901 *et seq.*

Following an unsuccessful request to the ALJ for reconsideration of the Initial Decision,² Respondents filed the Petition for Administrator Review that is the subject of this order.

DECISION ON DISCRETIONARY REVIEW

Under NOAA civil procedure regulations, a party seeking review of an initial decision issued by an ALJ must petition the NOAA Administrator within 30 days after the date the decision was served.³ Although the Administrator has broad discretion in determining whether to grant the petition and may deny it without explanation,⁴ past Administrator decisions have established two criteria to guide the decision of whether to grant discretionary review: (1) whether the initial decision contains significant factual or legal errors that warrant further review by the Administrator; and (2) whether fairness or other policy considerations warrant further consideration by the Administrator. Types of cases that fall within these criteria include, but are not limited to, those in which:

- The initial decision conflicts with decisions of one or more other NOAA administrative decisions or federal court decisions on an important issue of federal law;
- The ALJ decided an important federal question in a way that conflicts with prior rulings of the Administrator;
- The ALJ decided a question of federal law that is so important that the Administrator should pass upon it even absent a conflict; or
- The ALJ so far departed from the accepted and usual course of administrative proceedings as to call for an exercise of the Administrator's supervisory power.

Applying these criteria to the issues presented in Respondents' petition, I find no significant factual or legal errors in the Initial Decision and no fairness or other policy considerations warranting further consideration. I therefore deny Respondents' petition.

I find it appropriate, however, to clarify the Agency's position regarding the ALJ's recommendation to condition Respondent American Triumph LLC's permits to prohibit the hiring and/or retaining of Respondent Yen Min Yuan. Based on my review of the existing record, I have decided against adopting this recommendation, and I modify the Initial Decision to vacate the portion of the order that sets forth the ALJ's recommendation on this one point. All other parts of the Initial Decision, including the order awarding monetary civil penalties, remain unaffected by this modification.

² See Order Denying Respondents' Petition for Reconsideration (November 25, 2013).


³ See 15 C.F.R. § 904.273(a); see also 15 C.F.R. § 904.273(d) (setting forth mandatory requirements regarding the format and content of a petition for review).

⁴ See 15 C.F.R. § 904.273(c) ("Review by the Administrator of an initial decision is discretionary and is not a matter of right.") and 15 C.F.R. § 904.273(l) ("The Administrator need not give reasons for denying review.")

CONCLUSION

This Order constitutes the final administrative decision in this matter. This Order, and the civil penalty imposed by the ALJ, will become final on the date the Order is served on Respondents, and becomes effective for purpose of judicial review on the date of service.

14 April 2014
Dated



Kathryn D. Sullivan, Ph.D.
NOAA Administrator and Under Secretary of
Commerce for Oceans and Atmosphere

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the attached Order Denying Respondents' Petition for Discretionary Review was sent to the individuals listed below on this 17th day of April, 2014:

Via Registered or Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested and Facsimile Transmission:

James P. Walsh, Esq.
Gwen L. Fanger, Esq.
Davis Wright Tremaine LLP
505 Montgomery Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94111-6533
Fax: (415) 276-6599

Alexa A. Cole, Esq.
Charles L. Green, Esq.
NOAA Office of General Counsel
US Department of Commerce
1315 East West Highway
SSMC3 - Suite 15405
Silver Spring, MD 20910
Fax: (301) 427-2211

Via U.S. Mail and Facsimile Transmission:

Hon. Parlen L. McKenna
Administrative Law Judge
United States Coast Guard
Coast Guard Island, Bldg. 54A
Alameda, CA 94501-5100
Fax: (510) 437-2717

ALJ Docketing Center
United States Coast Guard
40 South Gay Street
Baltimore, MD 21202-4022
Fax: (410) 962-1746

April 17, 2014
Dated

Chauncey Kelly
Chauncey Kelly
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration